

REPORT

CONSTRUCTIVE MALE INVOLVEMENT IN SOUTH AFRICA

Bunie M Matlanyane Sexwale
February 2007

Commissioned by EngenderHealth South Africa

Contents

1. Introduction	2
2. Enabling instruments	4
3. Government inspired processes	7
4. Civil society initiatives	11
5. Issues, debates, challenges	19
6. Conclusions and recommendations	29
References	31
List of people interviewed	32
7. Inventory of CMI initiatives	33

Much thanx and appreciation to all people I spoke to formally and informally, long and short, willing and unwilling; those on whose shoulders I anchored; those who directed me to and or shared information and sources; those who made peaceful squatting spaces and other support available; those who fulfilled their promises and those who could or would not; those who waited, patiently or not; Much respect and big up the Afrikan brothers who, in the spirit of botho, have joined in re-imagining, re-inventing, re-finding and redeeming our individual and collective selves and the capacity to live in peace - against the tide. And, as usual, my sistas, my sisters, and my mother, the channel to my roots, morali'a Likobela, Letebele la Khambula!

BMMS buniems@gmail.com

1 INTRODUCTION

Introduction

'Recognizing the urgent need for a response to HIV/AIDS and gender based violence, EngenderHealth South Africa initiated a Men As Partners (MAP) program in 1998 with the twofold purpose to challenge the attitudes and behaviours held by men that compromise their own health and safety as well as the health and safety of women and children; and to encourage men to become actively involved in responding to gender based violence and the HIV/AIDS epidemic' (EngenderHealth office documents).

Eight years since the inception of MAP, EngenderHealth felt the need to learn about other initiatives directed at engaging men positively in issues related to gender based violence, HIV and AIDS. This is a report of a 35-day desk study commissioned by EngenderHealth South Africa with the objective to undertake a national audit to know the status of CMI (Constructive Male Involvement) in South Africa. EngenderHealth believes this may assist to promote innovation and coordination that will allow a systematic way of advancing work with men in order to contribute to a just and healthy South Africa for all.

To be sure, this is neither an evaluation of any specific organisation nor a scientific national survey, both of which would require different mandate, duration and resources. More mundane, the study has generated, in section 7, an inventory of organisations across the nine provinces of South Africa that have been set up with the specific objective to focus exclusively on CMI and those that have a broader focus but yet have integrated CMI into their work through deliberate programming, activities or through creation of CMI units as part and parcel of the organisation.

The second product is this descriptive narrative, a collation of some aspects of CMI initiatives. It is an exploratory piece that raises more points, debates and questions than it seeks to answer, with the hope that further and larger research will do them justice. Most of the answers will lie in going deeper into initiatives and the movement at large, going into the environment where they operate, getting views from recipients and so on. It is organised as follows. The first section introduces the paper, the methods used to collect and present the data and ends with an explanation of the limitations encountered during the research process. Section 2 describes some international and national instruments that define the context of constructive male involvement. How and within what organisational setup are men engaged? The next sections explore these questions as they describe CMI initiatives in the public sector, section three, and in civil society processes, section four. Various issues and debates invoked by CMI initiatives are the subject of section five. Section six concludes the paper with some recommendations.

Information gathering process

Information was gathered from websites, books, journals, and unpublished sources, and from general enquiries, discussions and interviews.

The research was initially intended as a 35-day internet-based desk study. However, it became evident from the onset that, for a variety of reasons, toiling only through the

internet would bring much too little harvest. Thus it was safe to assume that the absence of CMI information on the net was not necessarily evidence of non-existence of CMI related programs and activities in institutions. Tedious as it has come to be regarded, combing through written material added some valuable information at the same time as presenting challenges similar to the net (see limitations below). It became necessary, therefore, to embark on alternative data collection tactics - telephone, fax, email and face to face enquiries - albeit time consuming and expensive.

A research guide was developed and a random sample of informants interviewed. A small selection of these was in-depth, some on conditions of anonymity, and the majority were intended only to confirm existence and some basic information about the initiative concerned. All interviewees were also requested to give lists of CMI initiatives on their networks or known to them, in order to generate information that would grow the data base.

Most challenging was the selection process for inclusion on the data base. Though it has accumulated an impressive amount of literature mainly describing its expanding initiatives and the terrains of its playing fields, EngenderHealth has no off-the-shelf ready-made definition of 'constructive male involvement' that the TOR instructed me to hunt for. It can only be extrapolated. Just as well, perhaps, brief definitions often become diluted and depoliticised when the complexity and nuance is lost, as we see happen so often with 'gender'. So who is included here?

Like any strive for social transformation, the growing work on masculinities is a contested terrain, characterised by competing, conflicting and sometimes coinciding motivations. Men's initiatives claim no homogeneity. They range from those driven by pro-patriarchal/traditional masculinities philosophies to pro-feminist. Between and within the two extremes lie nuances, diversity, confusion and scope for growth. This study is concerned with the pro-feminist and the nuances in-between. Yet not many put their philosophical stance on websites nor do they necessarily define it this way, if at all. This necessitated a bottom-up analysis that begins with praxis. I decided to select groups based on the work they carry out, a brief description of which became one of the first questions asked.

Limitations of the study

The comprehensiveness of the results has been compromised by the study's timing, duration and resources in light of a number of interrelated challenges and impediments which need to be read together in order to appreciate their impact.

Technological advances have presented us with the internet as a fast and far reaching source of information that transcends traditional borders and many other barriers. Nevertheless, as a mode of data collection, the internet is not without limitations. It tends to reproduce much of the established hierarchies. Only some well resourced, often city/urban based and or internationally linked organisations, and some national and provincial government departments are on the net. Of these, many websites are rarely if at all updated, while institutions not set up specifically to focus on this topic do not necessarily post (sufficient) information on their constructive male involvement efforts.

In addition and like a photograph, information from written sources is relevant to the time of writing and publication; data so collected not necessarily reflecting most recent pictures.

Throughout November up to the third week of January, contacting relevant people became hazardous and often an exercise in futility due to preparations and execution of campaigns around the 16 days of activism, followed immediately by the end of year period during which some institutions close down or many officials take leave of absence while those who remain plead to be too thinly spread to accommodate interviews, or are not relevant. While to date some emails, telephone, fax and personally delivered messages remain unanswered, a handful of prospects declined interview requests. Significant among them are the National Department of Health Aids unit and leaders of the national chapters of two of the men's organisations whose experience would have thrown much light on the history and dynamics of the men's movement in South Africa. Yet one gaping hole is the absence on mainstream CMI websites of any reference to gay, lesbian, bisexual, transgendered etc. communities whose vulnerability to HIV&AIDS and gender based violence is starkly different from heterosexual groups. Attempts to interview a Gay and Lesbian Community Health Centre, to which I was referred late in the day, fell on less than fertile ground.

All the above then render the study exploratory and with some unavoidable biases. Before describing the status of CMI, let us turn our attention to factors that define the space within which CMI happens.

2 ENABLING INSTRUMENTS AND FRAMEWORKS

It is important to situate constructive male activism in the context of processes initiated and led by feminists and the larger women's and gender movements to provide a context. Desiree Lewis (2004) reminds us of the importance of international collaboration and instruments in assisting human rights activists and women's groups to negotiate with governments. Such instruments resulted from years of advocacy, lobbying, and bargaining within and between women's groups in different countries on the one hand, and states and their organisations on the other, particularly the UN system. These were part of the paraphernalia engaged by South African women and their allies (male and female), led by the ANC Women's League, through common platforms such as the Women's National Coalition process and other formations, as they lobbied hard for women and other human rights concerns to be included in the negotiation processes that followed the 1990 unbanning of liberation movements. Continuing advocacy, lobbying and campaigns have also drawn the attention to the centrality of gender relations and women's oppression around the symbiotic scourges, HIV&AIDS and violence.

The flux that defined the political space since February 1990 offered opportunities for introducing and or deepening gender discourses and activism. Drawing on a continuum of women's activism against medleys of traditional African and settler-colonial patriarchies¹, within and outside national liberation movements, feminists and gender activists worked hard to make sure that the ethos, definition and implementation of human rights in the new

¹ that can be traced back to the pre-colonial era, the little talked about periods of slavery, through to various forms of colonisation by Europeans and their descendents

dispensations would be gendered and nuanced. Many of these activists became politicians and other functionaries of the post-colonial state.

In this climate, the post-colonial state that came into being in 1994 moved fast, not only to participate at international forums, but also to recognise and commit South Africa to a number of international and regional instruments. 1995, early in its attainment of political freedom, South Africa ratified CEDAW without reservation. A valuable product of hard-won struggles of its time, CEDAW and the definitions it reflected have been lauded for, inter alia, naming the violence and putting it on the international (UN) agenda. However, writes Lewis (2004), these have been criticised for focusing on women to the exclusion of men, for defining the problem as 'violence against women' rather than the later conceived definition, 'gender based violence' (GBV) which is believed to overcome limitation flowing from the former, among these, the binary that narrowly portrayed men as perpetrators and women as victims. Re-focusing on gender directs us to interlocking dynamic systems within which gender power relations are constructed; to recognise how these interplay in the socialisation process that influences behaviour and produce heterogeneous identities; to unmask multiple forms of violence that occur as a cyclical continuum (Matlanyane Sexwale 1994, <http://www.survivors.org.za/>). It may also broaden possibilities for strategising, mobilising, acting and alliances. As it is expounded the concept opens room for strategies that include men's constructive involvement in struggles for social justice with a focus on gender equity and women's emancipation, and in specific areas of that struggle (such as gender based violence and AIDS). As usual, feminists are in no easy agreement regarding these concepts and the politics, strategies and practices they draw from and or lead to.

While the 1993 Vienna Declaration and Platform of Action on Violence Against Women 'was pioneering in its emphasis on the global pervasiveness of gender based violence and its calls on governments and the United Nations to take action against such violence' (Lewis 2004),² and even as it focused firmly on women and gender aspects, the 1994 Cairo Plan of Action on Population and Development clearly defines the need to involve men in reproductive sex and health matters. Hence it has become an oft cited international instrument in CMI circles.

South Africa participated in the framing of the twelve critical areas of the 1995 Beijing Platform for Action that include gender based violence and elaborate extensively on strategies to be followed by various sectors. It was among the states that bound themselves 1998 to the Addendum (to the SADC Gender Declaration) on the Prevention and Eradication of Violence Against Women that commits governments to use legislation, gender budgets, education and service provision to tackle violence (ibid).

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa adopted 1996 and the Bill of Rights and a litany of subsequent legislation define aspirations, context and limits, and assert, promote and protect the rights of all people to equality, security and freedom; bodily and psychological integrity, sexual, reproductive and other rights, gender equality and the empowerment of the marginalised, including women, children, differently abled, minorities,

² The ANC Women's Section/League gained and contributed much from participating in Vienna as well as in other international women's conferences around the world.

and so.³ They also open up space for democratic participation, freedom of speech, association etc. that become indispensable for organising. Different groups including women's advocacy groups continue the struggle on many fronts including the legislative sphere.

As Dzodzi Tsikata (1997) reminds us, that governments commit themselves to international rights instruments does not necessarily mean that they always (intend to) comply. Original motivations and competing pressures come to bear; Hence the need for a vigilant civil society⁴ (Lewis 2004). The making, adoption and application of laws are processes that define sites of struggle and contests. The ongoing struggles around the repeal of numerous colonial/apartheid era laws and the institution of legislation to match the spirit of the Constitution, that meet with the most determined resistance and pussy-footing when they involve women's rights, gender rights, sexual rights, and men's gender based violence against women, children and the vulnerable, are instructive, constant, and warning reminders of the deep entrenchment of heteropatriarchy (to borrow Pumla Dineo Gqola's term) in our society and globally. To underline this point, the Sexual Offences Bill has been stuck in the legislative process for almost a decade.

In addition, the lack of implementation of existing and emerging progressive laws by different government organs including the police and criminal justice system pose further impediment. Laws, as Kollapen warns, 'cannot penetrate the deep recesses of our mind where prejudices, myths and assumptions that make up who we are reside' (Potgieter 2005:157). Elsewhere officials from such institutions have agreed to be re/educated on gender and gender based violence but the South African judiciary has not been kin to embrace invitations to do so, while training for the police has been sporadic. The recent SAPS restructuring has, for now at least, added new problems to an already staggering system. All these stand as impediments to efforts to attack the double-edged epidemics, violence and HIV in their genderedness.

Inter-linkages are handy here. Drawing on historical evidence of women's struggles, victories and setbacks in the region and elsewhere, feminists have warned against putting all our eggs in the legislative and governance basket to the exclusion of activism at this and other levels. A major challenge in this respect is the depletion of human and other resources of the women's movement, NGOs and other groups, that occurred when used-to-be activists and major funding were redirected into government and other sectors post-1994. McFadden (2006), in addition, warns against believing and acting out the fable of South Africa's popularised exceptionalism that has come to perpetuate historical hierarchies and to gloss over difference and diversity to the detriment of the majority who are poor, black, and or women and or otherwise disadvantaged. We must not delude ourselves about the skewing of the benefits of narrow rights-based approaches, as the history and political

³ For detailed descriptions of some of these see f.i. Patricia Kumalo, 1997, Lewis 2004, Smythe and Parentzee 2003, 2004).

⁴ The invasions of different countries by the USA asserting its hegemony and dealing out its violence on societies across the world, in defiance of protocols of the UN to which it has committed itself, demonstrates the inability and unwillingness of international interstate bodies to hold non-complying governments accountable to any semblance of international community.

economy of South Africa stands, they are sure to follow patterns of privilege as defined by different permutations of space, race, class, and gender etcetera.

It is to realise the promise of the post-1994 commitment to gender equality, to safeguard the gains made thus far, and to make further inroad until full equity and social justice are achieved, that all sectors must and do work tirelessly together to make democracy a reality in all peoples lives, particularly the poor and otherwise marginalised who may not have the wherewithal to claim these rights. The sections that follow explore how men are involved constructively in the pursuit for gender equality and what some frame as gender justice, particularly in a world defined by gender based violence, HIV&AIDS and gender oppression. Because of the interdependence between government and civil society, the way the information has been organised is merely for trying to make sense of the findings.

3 GOVERNMENT INSPIRED PROCESSES

National Gender Machinery's constructive male involvement

Government has joined the local and global trend that recognises the necessity to include men as partners in the struggle for gender equality. Bafana Khumalo (interviewed) narrates a consultative process followed by the OSW in the Presidency to integrate CMI into government policy and practice. Three outcomes resulted. First, South Africa's 2004 representation and presentation at the CSW (UN's Commission on the Status of Women) and the commitments that it made through ratification of the deliberations regarding 'the role of men and boys in achieving gender equality' were informed by these consultations. Second, a task team was elected to draft a document proposing the setting up of a CMI body that will be incorporated into the National Gender Machinery (NGM). Third, the concept document has since been produced that tables the body's objectives, its roles and responsibilities, and those of its coordinating structure, plenary body and working group and spells out timeframes and activities which are clearly linked to those of the NGM forum. The Plenary Body proposed to meet twice a year consists of representatives from Cabinet, OSW, CGE, SALGA, Joint Parliamentary Monitoring Committee, Gender Focal Persons from all national departments, SANAC, the Private Sector and civil society organisations which include Women's Advocacy Organisations, Trade Unions, Traditional Leaders and Healers, Faith Based Organisations, the Academic Sector and NGOs/CBOs. The Working Group to be elected by the Plenary Body is to implement its (Plenary Body) recommendation through a secretariat and ad hoc task teams.⁵

This document has passed through all requisite motions and been approved. By end 2006 it awaited the nod of the Minister in the Presidency. A long process indeed and not without undue delays that recall challenges associated with OSW, which acts as secretariat for NGM, and those challenges specific to the NGM itself. Information gathering for South Africa's report to UN CSW due 2007 began with a workshop facilitated by Department of Social Development during 2006. That this was not being coordinated through OSW (by December 2006) has raised some questions. Some in the NGO sector are contemplating a complementary report that will focus on civil society.

⁵ See also Peacock and Botha (2006) and the slide presentation prepared by the interim task team

Commission on Gender Equality CGE⁶

The various commissions have also played some role in the struggle against gender based and general violence, HIV and Aids, commonly commissioning or commenting on studies on related aspects that expose incidence, recourse and loopholes in various areas, in fulfilment of their role to monitor and evaluate (gender) policies and practices. Naidoo (1997) lists the Human Rights, Gender and Youth Commissions as part of the organising and support for the 1997 men's march against violence.

The CGE identifies its first beneficiaries as women but emphasises the need to engage men. Its initial research endeavours revealed that women, African and rural people were not fully familiar with laws meant to protect them (Potgieter 2005). In tune with its mandate of public education, the CGE partnered with other institutions on a public education drive at various levels from legislature, local councils to communities, around various newly (or about to be) introduced legislation. It embarked on provincial men's summits during 2004 that culminated in a national men's summit held in Durban. Recommendations of these men's summits have been acknowledged among the motivations behind the development, consolidation and or launch of men's forums in several provinces.

The CGE process has not been without challenges, among them staff turnover and the long period that lapsed before commissioners were appointed for the current period. Some interviews revealed a serious void left by commissioners who had worked hard in municipalities. In places, some new coordinators and relevant staff replacements had neither the memory of the men's summits nor new plans in that direction. Some were challenged by lack of coordination of men's scattered efforts, while in other provinces there is sheer scarcity of men's organisations. But interviews also pointed at some success stories where work has continued, nevertheless, through more summits, training and collaborations.

Government departments

CMI initiatives will be affected positively or negatively by the level of general commitment towards gender equality and women's empowerment in each department and in the public service generally. The National Gender Framework recommends levels of seniority for provincial and national departmental GFPs, Gender Focal persons. Some departments have complied fully, allocated sufficient human resource, budgets for related internal processes and towards strengthening gender capacity in the services they offer, including in relevant civil society organs. Others have resorted to a number of very different choices. Interviews and other information show that some are known to have GFPs at lower levels - as low as Senior Administrator in some provincial departments. Many have clustered quite a number of responsibilities on GFPs, whatever their level, often including all Special Programs, and sometimes more. For others GFP duties are not part of the key performance areas on which they are assessed, thus making the work 'voluntary' and dependent on

⁶ Due to the reconstruction of its website during this period, information concerning CGE was gleaned from interviews with some Provincial Coordinators and staff and other informants. For this specific section, Appels, Khumalo, Mafadza, Mrwebo, Nxumalo, Tau, and CGE reports 2002, 2003.

individual enthusiasm and will. How these processes interface with the HIV&AIDS structures and work will also affect whatever CMI initiatives embarked on.

Various departments have developed or are in the process of developing policies and strategies in tune with the stipulations of the National Gender Framework and other policies that give guidance concerning cross-cutting issues such as gender equality and women's empowerment, HIV&AIDS, employee assistance, sexual harassment, and so on. With the general awareness that these must include some focus on CMI, departments have increasingly sought technical services from NGOs.

Nationally, provincially and at municipal level, some departments have also drawn on civil society CMI expertise in popularising and training communities around various gender based violence and HIV&AIDS related Bills and Acts, and extending services such as VCT training for nurses and others, roll out of ARVs and welfare packages and so on, with an emphasis on men's involvement (e.g. interview oa-Afrika, Tau). Department of Social Development sponsors various men's initiatives geared at getting men involved in community based efforts including home-based care and other aspects of HIV&AIDS (Amandla Madoda in KZN, SAMAG, Northwest etc). So does the Department of Health sponsor some CBOs (Soweto based Fathers Speak Out, Thusanang in Free State, etcetera).

In addition, Government has embarked on a number of CMI processes that have met with differing levels of success and survival, nationally, provincially and locally. Some have dwindled while others have ridden out the storm. 2006 was replete with re/launches of departmental initiatives (e.g. Justice, Police in various stations, Roads, Transport), many around the period of the 16 days of activism and the World Aids Day, which period also enjoys numerous public displays by government and departments targeted at GBV, HIV&AIDS. More recently these include CMI specific words and action. Provincial and local organisations called Men In Action, MIA, are associated with the Department of Social Development's sponsorship.

National, provincial, district and local AIDS Councils

The South African National Strategy on HIV&AIDS stresses partnerships and inter-sectoral cooperation. It provides for the establishment of Aids Councils at all three spheres of governance - national, provincial and local. The Presidency, Premiers and Mayors are expected to ensure political leadership and commitment and to chair the AIDS Councils, which are broad stakeholder coordinating structures (Ngonini slide presentation 2006). The Men's Forum in the Free State is represented in Provincial and some Local AIDS Councils (Moloi, Tau). Planned to be launched early 2007, the new National Strategic Plan for HIV/AIDS indicates clear targets up to 2011. Its development enjoyed contributions by Government, business and civil society (Health-e News Service 30.01.'07).

In line with the Local Government White paper that stresses local government role in development and service delivery to address socio-economic problems, the Integrated Development Plans (IDPs) require municipalities to have a plan to address HIV&AIDS, although thus far municipal HIV&AIDS work is an unfunded mandate (Ngonini op cit).

The national coordinating body, SANAC (South African National Aids Council) which has hitherto not been terribly active has recently (late 2006) been revived under the leadership of Deputy President Mlambo-Ngcuka with the Department of Health, and is in the process of being restructured. In this context and in light of the New Aids plan, Mikosi, the men's sector representative at SANAC advised that a men's summit is in the pipeline, early 2007, to thresh out issues affecting men and their representation (interview).

ETU, Education and Training Unit, affords technical support to municipalities to execute their mandate, which includes AIDS policy and strategy development and implementation, and effective political leadership. While ETU addresses gender issues in the process of their training and support work, it does not specialise on CMI. This provides a window of opportunity for CMI focused organisations to foster collaboration and afford technical support in the provinces of ETU's operation (ETU staff, www.etu.org.za). Although some of the NGOs also engage in capacity building and leadership development with a specific emphasis on 'initiatives that promote gender equality, empower women, and engage men' (http://www.genderjustice.org.za/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=11/15/2006), more are needed.

Truckers and commercial sex workers

Roadside clinics for truckers were initiated since 2001 under the auspices of the Transport Sector HIV&AIDS Committee, coordinated by the Department of Transport and serviced by the Department of Health (Mkosana). No one would say why but some of them had stopped functioning 2005/6, the Free State one looking like a shop. The few that survived in the Eastern Cape, have sharpened their strategies, activities and methods overtime, while navigating the difficult Karoo political space - no thanks to the Department of Transport. During 2006 there were (re)launches that included new sites.

According to Xolani Tshandu (interview), on Department of Health sponsorship, Eastern Cape PPASA provides two staff members as technical support, each devoted to running well functioning truckers program and commercial sex worker program, respectively, on 4 sites in Beaufort West, the Karoo. The project runs roadside clinics offering VCT on site, provides truckers with information CDs in isiZulu (soon to be translated into English and Afrikaans) using 'truckers language' for listening while driving, and runs a 10-day peer educators training - a mobile MAP. Msimang (2006) writes that government-run programs address sex workers as health threats and rarely focus on stopping the violence against them. The DoH/PPASA Karoo project appears well coordinated with all stakeholders from existing local forums including SAPS officers who patrol the area. Volunteers are reported to have cleared shrubs from an area that had become unsafe for the sex workers. This may indicate an interesting but unanswered question of changing social attitudes towards sex work.

Truckers' programs succeed most when they are agreed between truck drivers and employers, states HST (2006) believing this to be the case in South Africa. Not so according to Tshandu who had to abandon training planned for staff of trucking companies because of resistance from companies and competition between unions/NGOs. Reality on the ground, he says, 'truck companies are owned by old white men with old ideas'. The Karoo became viable, Social Development and other departments moved in, NGOs have sprung up

and are competing to offer the same services including those NGOs working with truckers' unions. This also means well trained peer educators are in demand for higher stipends.

Men in Partnership against AIDS, MIPAA

Men in Partnership Against AIDS (MIPAA) was necessitated by the growing realisation that the constructive participation of men was imperative if the fight against the twin scourges, gender based violence and HIV&AIDS, was to be won. An outcome of the DoH Government's Aids Action Plan unit, GAAP-organised Men's National Imbizo held in Cape Town, October 2002, MIPAA was envisaged as a countrywide forum of men, vocal and active in the fight against HIV&AIDS. During 2003 men were mobilised to develop provincial and local strategies and structures to deal with HIV&AIDS and related issues, while February and March 2004 were dedicated to provincial men's marches culminating in the 'Million Men March' in Durban (see Gobind 2005).

Like some of the government-led and top-down post-1994 women and gender initiatives, MIPAA has met differing levels of success and is entangled in a number of political and administrative challenges that have led variously to its stillbirth in some places and weakness in others. Interestingly its chairperson, Gobind (2005), identifies lack of funds as the only constraint. A comprehensive study of its rise and partial fall is not part of this paper. Suffice it to mention that interviews point to the following province-specific details. Non-involvement of existing men's organisations at its inception in Free State Province led to (perceptions of) unhealthy competition and loss of opportunity to pool resources and to learn from ongoing CMI experience. The 2006 re-launch corrected this oversight that also points to challenges concerning relations between government, political and managing executives, civil society and dynamics of the public service sector. North West has considered situating MIPAA at the PCA, Provincial Council for Aids, except that the PCA's role is that of monitoring. Hopes have now been pinned on the ongoing restructuring at the DoH where a Gender directorate is in the air. Lamenting the dearth of MIPAA activity in his district, a gender activist in umKanyakude exclaimed in an interview, 'ibudget e khona but uya siyazi izinto ze gulumente', a phrase frequently uttered, in different languages, when one enquires after MIPAA (interviews Appels, oa-Afrika, Moloji, Mthethwa, Tau).

MIPAA's problems of location and (dys)function cannot be understood without contextualising it within the politics of gender equality, women's empowerment and resistance (to transformation) mechanisms in public bureaucratic machinations that may also explain the institutional hazards associated with some Offices on the Status of Women, Gender Focal Persons, discussed above, and other (sub)directorates where coordination of similar initiatives and of cross-cutting issues is located (or as often happens, dumped), twelve years down the political independence line. While there are vast disparities within and between national and provincial departments, and there are changes (improvements or declines) over time and as senior managers come and go, interviews point out the following additional challenges in some departments. Transformation appears to be stunted by the whims of senior managers who disable individual and collective transformative agency through demobilisation, labelling and thwarting efforts and or the smooth functioning of those defined negatively as radical, feminist or whatever else, through blatant violations of labour laws and DPSA human resource management policies and

procedures. Many senior managers lack gender consciousness and commitment but refuse to attend relevant training, among them, are those who find gender work unnecessary depletion of their departmental budgets, or who for other 'unofficial' reasons, restrict or withhold budget allocations.

4 CIVIL SOCIETY INITIATIVES

The CMI journey since the 1990s

Historically, men in South Africa have organised consciously around their concerns as men, though these may not have been acknowledged as such. One may recall the End Conscription Campaign by white men resisting conscription and service in the apartheid defence force. It is difficult to pinpoint the genesis of men's activism that is informed by commitment to women's emancipation and comprehension of patriarchal oppression. In any society there will always be some individuals who stand up and act against oppression and discrimination, for whatever reasons and from whatever knowledge system source. There, therefore, has to have been individual men who have stood against patriarchal oppression against women, children and other men, in its myriad forms - our histories and herstories remain largely oral, yet to be told. There were, for instance, men who, quietly or publicly, spoke out or acted in support of victims of incest, rapes etc. in the country and in exile spaces of the liberation movements, often suffering the wrath of heteropatriarchy - stories that remain to be told publicly for the nation to heal and reconcile. I am also mindful that, once conceived, initiatives take time and work to come to fruition, if at all. The periodization therefore may not be fully reflective of history.

What follows is a rough picture of the CMI journey in South Africa, through time and space since the 1990s, as emerged in the literature and interviews. As it is impossible to describe all initiatives individually, only a few examples are used in this narrative, the rest are listed in the inventory marked section 7.

Initiated in 1993, the Cape Town based 5in6 Project appears to be the first recorded organised male constructive engagement with men's gender based violence against women, children and communities. It became most visible and audible through its Ordinary Heroes campaign that encouraged people to submit stories about 'good men' in their lives in order to make visible the 5 in 6 men who some statistics claimed were non-violent. The project also ran preventative and awareness raising training workshops for men in corporate, government, farms and civic communities (Agenda 37, 1998, HST 2006).

Mmatshilo Motsei returned home from a conference in Dublin, Ireland, in 1996 to prepare ground for a 3-year collaboration with Luke Daniels of London's Every Man's Centre who would provide technical support working with young men in Alex. The dawn of 1997 birthed a men's unit within a women's organisation, ADAPT, Agisanang Domestic Abuse Prevention and Training, in Alexandra, Johannesburg, that would focus on advocacy, training and counselling services for healing male perpetrators of gender based violence using a variety of strategies, as part of ADAPT's overall work against men's violence against women, children and other vulnerable groups. This would have far reaching repercussions re CMI.

A number of things came together. Women survivors of domestic violence used to bring men to the ADAPT clinic because they did not want to divorce but wanted the batterer (husbands) to change. One day a woman requested help with her police officer husband. He came in with body language exuding power and authority, intimidating, silencing, and a gun: gun=police=violence=job-description,; 'violence is my work'.

I subdued myself, answered everything. He ultimately relaxed, covered his gun with his shirt and began to discuss in earnest. I took him as a brother, discussed with him as a black man in police service under apartheid, explained how he had been conditioned. He asked for help ... It was a black woman talking to a black man...

I was healing from my personal trauma. We were finally talking as human with the ex-husband who had abused me... I had been to programs of male batterers in Canada and the US. I had listened to men excusing their abuse. I was enraged...

I met Luke Daniels in 1996 in Dublin. He was part of a session with men from all over the world talking the pain and cost of socialisation. They cried... When the facilitator said this can be generalised to all men, I thought of men in Alex during the ANC-Inkatha battles... (Interview Mmatshilo Motsei, Founder and Director ADAPT)

For one gruelling year, twelve young men (selected from 30 applicants) underwent voluntary training under this project, 'working on their own issues', beginning the personal healing journey while training and counselling other men, mobilising, organising marches and so on. Having done groundbreaking work at ADAPT, some of these young men have stayed the CMI course and become gender professionals and activists who have initiated and or strengthened CMI making an impact in various local and international NGOs, Government Departments, corporate companies and elsewhere (interview Mabizela, Motsei, see also Motsei 2004/2005, Naidoo 1997, Hayward 2005).

ADAPT's men's initiatives are believed to have inspired the establishment of groups such as Men for Change and SAMF, the South African Men's Forum, 1998, that formed following the decision at the October 1997 launch of the Restoring the Souls of the Nation Initiative.⁷ The two are independent and initially Johannesburg based men's organisations that spread, died, survived or re-invented in different provinces over the years⁸ (interviews Motsei, Mabizela, Tau, see also Khumalo 1998).

The wave of reconceptualisation seems to have touched quite a number of women's spaces during

and following 1997. From a felt need, own or other sources of inspirations, and for some, after much introspection, other women's organisations have since included a focus on men in their work. Mandisa Monakali wrote in 1997:(99) that Ilitha Labantu, a Gugulethu based women's organisation, involved men because 'finding solutions to end all forms of violence can only be effected if both men and women became involved in the education process'. In that same year, the Gender Equity Unit, GEU, of the University of the Western Cape, UWC, announced its intention to restructure both the unit and its work to include masculinities as well as femininities as part of the realisation that 'gender equity cannot be achieved in any organisation in the absence of an ongoing engagement with the gender of men'. GEU began running seminars, workshops on Gender and Men, with the assistance of a local gender

⁷ Bongani Khumalo (1998), the moving force behind it, dates the establishment of SAMF early 1998. Motsei recalls details that confirm Khumalo's account in her interview, while Naidoo's (1997) list of organisations that supported and co-organised the November 1997 national march does not include SAMF. This evidence contradicts the claim by Peacock and Botha (2006) who list SAMF among the organisers of the 1997 men's march - which they interestingly shrink to only three - before its establishment.

⁸ For instance, Men for Change disbanded and re-formed as Men's Forum in the Free State when they found the constitution of the latter more suitable to their aspirations (Tau interview).

training organisation, GETNET, Gender Education and Training Network, and a scholar from a British university (Oyegun 1998:15).

As a health professional Makhaye (1998) had observed men taking decisions over women's bodies and sexuality. Motivated, inter alia, by this and the NPPHCN's 1996 research that 'revealed that men perceived women's role as fulfilling the sexual needs of men and that it is men who take decisions around sexual health issues', the NGO she coordinated, Targeted AIDS Interventions, TAI, decided to change focus from women to men. Specifically TAI's Shosholoza project launched 1998 targeted men in soccer through collaborating with SAFA structures in four KZN regions and mobilising support with Local Government and the Department of Sports and Recreation. The training manual and methods were carefully designed from a 9-month research on knowledge, attitudes and practices of men in soccer about AIDS. By end December 2006 <http://www.targetaids.co.za/main.htm> described three young-men-focused TAI components that are divided according to peer educator age group, each with a number of AIDS-specific modules, positive sexuality and positive masculinity, servicing large populations in disadvantaged communities.

1998 again, WFP, Women on Farm Project, teamed up with the 5in6 project to pilot a training project that would include men for the first time in WFP's work dealing with domestic violence on the Western Cape farms (Parentzee 1998). Masimanyane Women's Support Centre, East London, Eastern Cape, began its Men's project, MMP, in 2000. Its advocacy, research, support and legal services, aimed to end men's violent behaviour, challenge societal values and address political and economic concerns, have reached men (and women) in prisons, trade unions, municipalities, schools and other spaces in communities (<http://www.masimanyane.org.za>). Providing an increasingly much sought after service, Thusanang Advocacy Centre, Qwaqwa, whose work had focused on various services for abused women, established men's forums in three villages. It trained twelve men per village in HIV&AIDS and gender based violence, since 2004 (interview Tau, Nhlapo, Komako).

Differently constituted, GETNET has, since its inception in 1995, been a mixed entity with men and women trainers and board members. Against a climate of cynicism, it broadened focus to developing 'the new man' by raising men's gender awareness on masculinities through training workshops that ran from 1997 in different provinces. Conceptualised in mid-1996, this focus has expanded to a full fledged training program for men employed as transformation officers, diversity trainers, human resource managers, those responsible for the formulation and implementation of policy (Daphne 1998, <http://www.getnet.org.za>).

Foreign organisations entered the fray from 1998. PPASA, Planned Parenthood Association South Africa partnered with (the then USA predecessor of) EngenderHealth, to develop and introduce the Men As Partners program, MAP, in South Africa. By then PPASA had transformed from its colonial-apartheid past and racially integrated. Coinciding with South Africa's attainment of political independence and the Cairo Plan of Action 1994, not only did PPASA nationalise, it shifted focus, in tune with developments internationally, from narrow family planning to sexual and reproductive health, expanded through the nine provinces and established clinics and youth programs as well as LoveLife. The objectives of MAP were to involve men to play constructive role in sexual and reproductive health, SRH, to prevent

STIs, sexually transmitted infections including HIV, and gender based violence, and to transform attitudes and behaviour. The project ran a chain of PPASA training workshops with EngenderHealth providing technical assistance through the MAP methodology which it patented. The partnership later extended to include another organisation with American origins, Hope World Wide, whose strength was in its embedding in various communities in Soweto, Johannesburg.

The trio has trained and supported a broad spectrum of men in government departments, corporate, trade unions, churches, CBOs, and various other structures, in the process building a MAP network (discussed later). It produced graduates of varying calibre, some of whom have come to be counted among the leaders in the CMI industry and activism. Its methods have expanded and developed as the program and network gained experience, made successes and met challenges. <http://www.EngenderHealth.org>, <http://www.ppasa.org.za/> <http://www.populationcouncil.org>,

Sinani the KwaZulu-Natal program of survivors of violence with branches in Durban and Pietermaritzburg is focused towards building the social fabric of communities most severely affected by cycles of violence. As part of its 3 programs - peace building, poverty alleviation and HIV and AIDS - it has projects focused, among others, on men as well as women and gender based violence <http://www.survivors.org.za/> .

There is now a rich milieu of organisations, units, programs and other attempts to transform masculinities and involve men constructively in gender relations, gender based violence, SRH, HIV etc. They are disproportionately distributed throughout the country (see Section 7). Some small and rural initiatives deserve mention: Siyanakekela in Matatiele once existed; Venda based Munna Ndi Nnyi? on which the Limpopo CGE relies for workshop design and facilitation, is well established and does positive work among men (interview Mafadza); Amandla Madoda in umMkhanyakude District, rural KZN (population +-5000) on the SA border with Mozambique and Swaziland, "works to develop a local brand of 'protective masculinity' where men take responsibility to improve their partners' and their own health" (HST 2006:159, interviews Friedman, Mthetwa).

NGOs have appeared outside metropolises and seem to be making their mark. SAMAG, South African Men's Action Group, in Mafikeng, North West, was set up to do advocacy work for men. Nevertheless since its founding July 2004, there has been so much demand for its professional services by different government departments that the advocacy idea has stayed on the shelf for the time being, while attention has turned to research, training and other support (interview oa-Afrika).

The latest, Sonke Gender Justice, entered the CMI/MAP scene with a big bang February 2006, boasting staff with long-term CMI commitment and experience with MAP,⁹ and an array of over six projects servicing rural, urban, township communities, children, the youth, women, men, fathers, governments, farms, schools and so on. It also enjoys wide ranging partnerships, from UN agencies to government and civil society organisations across the

⁹ Thanks largely to the triad responsible for the spread of MAP: EngenderHealth, Hope World Wide and PPASA.

SADC region where it operates, including groups in areas like Mthata (Eastern Cape), Nkandla (rural KZN), Welkom and Qwawa (Free State) where they have insisted to work with men at imbizos and strengthen a women's shelter. In partnership with the Western Cape Provincial Government Sonke has branded its *One Man Can* campaign to be implemented throughout Southern Africa, which was launched in Geneva at the UN coinciding with the 2006 16 days of activism. Having learned incisive lessons in various gender and CMI spaces that its staff and leadership have traversed over the years, Sonke, at the onset, has both women and men's programs (among others) combined and dialoguing under one roof (interview Khumalo, www.genderjustice.org.za).

Action Research Initiatives

Participatory and action research has made a major contribution in positively involving men in various aspects of masculinities work. Some organisations offer research as one of their services as well as doing research to reflect on and deepen their work and to collect up-to-date information on the communities they service (Masimanyane, Sinani, TAI etcetera). They may also be commissioned to research on behalf of others or team up with government, academic and research institutions, NGOs, donor and other entities. Among others, GETNET coordinated research that led to the establishment of gender-focused parliamentary structures and the CGE. SAMAG has undertaken action research for provincial DoH to ascertain why men are not involved in primary HIV prevention and VCT services; have done mapping and zoning that has resulted in wellness clinics being set up in three areas for truckers and commercial sex workers. Among its research, Sonke Gender Justice is conducting a study for OSISA into the impact of PEPFAR funding.

The Health Systems Trust (2006), Male Sexuality and Reproductive Health Project's study in communities in KZN, Mpumalanga, North West, aimed to sensitise and educate male leadership to fight against HIV, to protect women, children and themselves and encourage growth of a social support movement around HIV and SRH. In 2000 the Population Council (Frontiers), University of the Witwatersrand's Reproductive Health Research Unit and the KwaZulu-Natal Department of Health collaborated on a 17-month study in 12 rural and urban KZN clinics, aimed at the feasibility, reproductive health impact, and cost of involving men in their partners' maternal care for the improvement of reproductive health and pregnancy outcomes. Pre/post-intervention surveys were conducted on men and women partners http://www.popcouncil.org/frontiers/projects_pubs/countries/africa/southafrica.html.

Amandla Madoda acknowledges voluntary contribution of a researcher (initially from umMhlabisa based Africa Centre Research Centre and now with HST, Durban) who travels 8-hour trip each month to support the development and sustainability of the group's outlook and activities, 'wasi siza uIrwin' (interview Mthethwa). The HSRC, Human Sciences Research Council, Youth and Family Development Programme launched the Fatherhood Project through a travelling photo exhibition accompanied by events hosted by a partner organisation 'to promote constructive male involvement in the care and protection of children'. Portraying fathers in positive postures, the 120 photos were selected from hundreds taken by professional photographers, students and children aged 10-13 in Soweto, Johannesburg and a rural area outside Durban. The project also published research in an anthology (*Baba*) that 'demonstrates the centrality of fathers in the lives of men and in the experiences of

children' arguing that 'fathers can make a major contribution to the health of South African society' (Richter and Morrell, 2006: vi).

General CMI trends Across the country, government, business and communities are also serviced and facilitated by many urban based and larger national and international organisations, academic and other institutions, some of which are 'suitcase experts' while others have established branches in various provinces and localities. Townships, informal settlements and other peri-urban communities have also embarked on initiatives too numerous to mention. So have professional bodies and institutions.

All the initiatives listed in section 7 vary greatly in size, scope, age, activities, areas of focus, methodologies, constituencies, beneficiaries, resources, accessibility, sustainability, possibilities, influence, contacts, and so on. They cover the landscape of civil society and traverse the spaces where people interact and enter into social relationships, invariably relations of power and powerlessness, spaces where people are socialised, where people do gender (phraseology West and Zimmerman 1987 in Lorber 1994) all the time, from cradle to grave, where they live, trade, work, struggle, worship, organise, cure, heal, learn, teach, travel, play, socialise, make love, sex and war, are imprisoned, and so on. Together they service and collaborate with a variety of institutions - children, youth, fathers, men and women, political, traditional and religious leadership, three spheres of government and governance related structures, the corporate sector, educational institutions of all levels, civil society organisations and individual citizens etc.

Some initiatives are wholly dependent on volunteers while others boast staff sizes between one and large numbers, others rely on both their staff complement and a horde of volunteers. Although staff turnover is a general problem affecting all sectors, the capacity to cushion institutions differs. Most CMIs are hit hard by this phenomenon. Yet there is an unusual side peculiar to CMI because of reliance on peer educators. Many organisations work through volunteers who get only stipends and no salaries. In the current climate of high unemployment and poverty, young men and women often work as volunteers while actively job-hunting as well. This reality results in high volunteer turnover as people find paid employment or an organisation offering higher stipends. Sometimes it is so drastic that some initiatives that have wholly volunteers-reliant MAP/CMI components have had to wind them up when these volunteers find waged employment, the Soweto branch of the South African Red Cross Society being a point in case (interview Mantshali, Tshandu). This staffing problem reflects the delicate funding position of many initiatives that depend on foreign, government and other funding that they complain is time bound and therefore creates uncertainty, or forces them to implement donor-driven agendas.

CMI groups employ a variety of strategies with commonalities and differences: gender awareness training, masculinities awareness, skills training, AIDS awareness training, sexual and reproductive health and rights, leadership training, care, counselling and support, trauma counselling; Public events, sports, mentorship and role modelling for boys, outreach, edutainment; Community development in various aspects, paralegal support, public education, media, research, organisational development, and so on. The array of methods used mostly anchor on one form or other of participatory and experiential approaches.

Public performances and mobilisation

The drive to re-make, reform or revolutionise masculinities to veer away from combative constructions has also assumed public dimensions in the form of marches, theatre, and other mediums, since the 1990s.

Taking place in an impoverished Johannesburg township fondly known as Alex which had been the arena of some of the most horrendous political violence of the darkest hour of the apartheid era, the ADAPT-organised May, 1997 men's march appears the first of its kind in South Africa. While acknowledging colonial-apartheid legacies, it was to register publicly that hundreds of men wanted men's violence against women and children to stop. It was to give men a chance to break away from the habit of violence in all its forms, to unlearn negative effects of their socialisation. It was also to encourage women and non-violent men to speak out.

The march was addressed by the late Drake Koka who drew from African philosophy and culture to urge men to honour women and children, noting that by raping women, men were cutting the link with spirituality. Raymond Suttner, MP, spoke from experience about the lack of support for male relatives of women rape survivors (Interview Motsei).

The protest inspired SANGOCO leadership, with the support and collaboration of others,¹⁰ to facilitate a national march of over 3000 men, in Pretoria, the seat of government, on the same theme in November the same year. The March hosted the then President Mandela as speaker. A month earlier, the 250-strong men's group that launched the Restoring the Soul of the nation Initiative had resolved to support the march, and thus ensured the high participation of a broad spectrum of leaders (and followers) from the various organs and sectors, taking the Alex initiative to another level (as Motsei said to console the young men who thought their initiative was being snatched by politicians and other high profile men). 'Real men do not abuse women' was a slogan adopted 'to challenge the notion that aggressiveness, abusive behaviour and authoritarianism is what masculinity is all about' (Naidoo 1997:95).

Many organisations now have high profile events as one of their strategies. In the ensuing decade, a number of men's marches have followed - high profile and grassroots. The 2004 MIPAA provincial and national marches focused on men and AIDS. Other latter years' marches have made a strong connection between gender discrimination, sexuality, violence and HIV&AIDS. It is now common to see activities of the 16 days accompanied by some public performance and involving political, religious and traditional leaders and followers and officials of various public and private entities. Even mixed marches now habitually address men's violence and men's responsibility to change themselves and society, to live lifestyles of non-violence and ABC, and so on. Perceptions about their impact differ.

¹⁰ The Department of Welfare, the Human Rights, Gender and Youth Commissions, the Greater Pretoria Metropolitan Council, Women's National Coalition, Network of Violence Against Women, ADAPT, Children's Rights Committee, SA Congress for Early Childhood Development (Naidoo 1997), see also footnote 7.

The media has also played its role popularising these events often harping on speeches of high profile personalities. Various SABC programs hosted male gender activists during the 2006 16Days, while grassroots efforts populated local papers and radio. Not only have CMI initiatives engaged the media, some media organisations have embraced CMI, formed working relationships with CMI entities, and or undertaken initiatives of their own e.g. PPASA's LoveLife, SABC Limpopo's initiated marches, GEMSA.

Public performances have also included CMI elements through sports and stadiums activities, conventional and ambush theatre, debates and talk shows, in various locations including tarvens, shebeens, schools, bus ranks, clinics, etc., usually by youth organisations - inter alia, Shosholozza in Pietermaritzburg, Hope World Wide in Soweto, Youth Channel Group in Tembisa, Sabelani in Thokoza, Personal Concept Emdeni.

5 ISSUES, DEBATES, CHALLENGES

Ruptures, Perceptions, Politics, challenges, the need to build bridges

While expressing a view that 'MIPAA activities do not deal in any depth with issues of masculinity', the Health Systems Trust (2006) makes an important point that MIPAA has not yet been evaluated. This problem is not peculiar to MIPAA, however, among others, Peacock, Khumalo and McNab (2006) make a similar observation with regard to the CMI project at large. Significantly, conducting a comprehensive CMI audit is one of the proposed roles and responsibilities of the NGM's Men and Gender Equality Program-in-the-making. It is opportune to venture below into identifying a few salient issues, challenges and ruptures that appear to plague CMI that beg inclusion in further agendas if/when they transpire.

Workshops and training

Like feminists before and now, groups working positively with men rely a lot on training workshops of different levels and for differing goals. It seems each generation of gender trainers comes to the same realisation time and again. "Hit and run' training reduces efficacy of impact", as Sinani puts it on their website. There is a growing realisation (yet again) of the shortsightedness of concentrating *exclusively* on workshops without making linkages with other programs and other forms of activism. Many CMI groups run short duration workshops, ranging anything from a part of a day to a week (and more for very few). It is only after they have completed the first set or even the first (one, Two, Three, years?) project cycle of training workshops that they begin to ask, 'Will the pressures of a deeply patriarchal society overwhelm even the most sincere attempts to adopt a new masculine identity and life style' (Daphne 1998)? Many now include men's support groups, peer educators, elements of community work including economic empowerment projects and so on. Those embedded in women's organisations are part of strategies already in place - this is not to suggest that they are free of challenges.

There is another workshop related question. Will training a bunch of men and releasing them back into their homes and communities, aspiring (or marked with) 'a new masculine identity'

transform society? Tshabalala (2005) emphasises the need to mobilise in communities, government and workplaces. Friedman (interviewed) points to the need to create movements. Peacock, Khumalo, McNab (2006) recommend that organisations working with men should engage rights-based activism - phraseology pregnant with different meanings - using TAC, Treatment Action Campaign, as an example. Noting its progression, transformation, and increasing grassrootsness and gender sensitivity, TAC is interestingly an example also used by Msimang (2006) urging women's movements to move beyond workshops and the focus on the state, policy and law making version of rights-based activism that has preoccupied Southern African women's activism since the 1980s.

In addition to AIDS awareness, the most common is training for gender awareness, which for many has become synonymous with training to understand aspects of masculinities. This is done from a mix of philosophical understandings - ways of being and of doing. I cannot speak with authority on all organisations' manuals as I have glimpsed only a few that would do with some serious reworking of concepts. The simplistic conceptualisation of gender and the 'tools' that dominated 'gender training' in the 1980s to early 1990s, developed within two prestigious institutions, Harvard (by Overholt et al) and London School of Economics (by Caroline Moser) are back in their initial raw depoliticised and otherwise problematic versions. Unfortunately their limitations, long critiqued by feminist scholarship, activists and others in gender training platforms, have not made it into these CMI manuals (Matlanyane Sexwale 1996, Tsikata 2001, White 2003). Yet again this raises the question of continuities and discontinuities between and within women and men's movements and the professionals who service them over time and space. Most of the masculinities/ CMI publications tend to communicate only among themselves. As Desiree Lewis (interview) opines,

Most of the work is descriptive and draws opportunistically on feminist theory without acknowledging this. So the masculinities field is not at all new, though it pretends to be. Also, the opportunistic women, including so-called feminist researchers, have band-wagoned on masculinity studies as flavour of the month.

While acknowledging the contribution made by these studies to ongoing CMI work, it is important to heed this remark as it lies behind most strategic, ideological and political concerts and conflicts that cloud cooperation among and between men gender activists on the one hand and feminists and women gender activists on the other, which negatively affects work towards the common goal of egalitarian relations and social justice. The need for dialogue increases with every point made: (writing space shrinks at the same pace).

Role models that promote CMI

Views about role models differ much. Jabu oa-Afrika aptly points out that many men are seen by someone as a role model whether they know or choose to be, which is why all men have to strive to be positive role models. The 5in6 campaign highlighted this through their 1999 'everyday hero' campaign. Similarly, SAMAG aims to invite communities to nominate their heroes in four North West districts.

I found it impossible to glean information from written sources on EngenderHealth's brief to identify role models that promote CMI. Questions prompted conflicting reactions and as many role models as the number of interviewees asked. They ranged from the state President for being gender-conscious and for appointing women to positions of power, Steve Biko for encouraging black men and women to regain self-esteem, identity and psychological liberation, high profile figures and male gender activists that frequently appear in the media, to family, friends, mentors, and 'ordinary men in communities'. All those who commented on race emphasised that role models 'had to be black men' and or 'could not be white', reflective of the political and geographic landscapes of CMI work and hence my interviewee sampling.

The question raised about individuals is whether they promote CMI in public as well as in interpersonal relations, i.e. in daily lived praxis. Are they making the personal political? Take Steve Biko as an example. Various accounts of the Black Consciousness Movement bear testimony to Biko and his male comrades' lack of gender consciousness and respect for women's bodily and other autonomy. Their contribution to black and national liberation notwithstanding, these are not shining examples of constructive male involvement in the context of gender based violence and HIV&AIDS. The hegemonic masculinities manifested by this generation of comrades are a far cry from CMI role modelling in this context. That some proponents have retorted that HIV&AIDS were not yet a (major) problem actually underscores, rather than refutes, my point. Recently Pumla Dineo Gqola (2006) asked a pertinent question, 'What happened to all those young men who were jack-rollers and *iintsara* (of the revolutionary 1980s)?' We may ask in addition, what happened to those other male leaders, activists and citizens of the BCM era, its forerunner and militarised successor liberation movement fraternity, who abused women with impunity or witnessed the abuse in silence? There are many among the living proposed role models with similar history, past and or present (see also Xaba 2001). A few have become gender conscientised, committed and continuously working to change and are evolving into genuine CMI role models. Some re/lapse into the schizophrenia of being 'public' promoters of CMI and 'private' abusers of women while others are devoid of any gender consciousness. 'We need to highlight and celebrate the stories of those men who defy stereotypes and demonstrate commitment to gender equality' (Piliso-Seroke in CGE 2005), *holistically*, if I may add.

Projects (such as the HSRC fatherhood project www.hsrbpress.co.za, NISAA institute for women's development <http://www.nisaa.org.za/>, fathers Speak out, etc) have embarked on constructing positive fatherhood role models. Many projects have used prominent men such as musicians and other artists, football stars, politicians, etcetera, to role model CMI in various ways. This approach is under threat as exceptionally high numbers of prominent men have been accused of committing various forms of violence: wife and partner beatings, sexual harassment, rape, child abuse, statutory rape, etcetera, some having been convicted, some discharged, some not reached the courts and others not even reported.

Whatever the verdict, if any, these cases have exposed the carelessness, gender blindness and disregard for current laws and procedures by the criminal justice officials involved. They reveal the fault-lines in the system regarding the conceptualisation of gender based violence, particularly rape, date and statutory rape and sexual harassment. They reveal the

dynamics of heteropatriarchal and other power, the complexity of gender identities and alliances, and the role played by women and men in perpetuating patriarchy and misogyny. (Recall the sex pest saga and the roles played by women Minister and officials at Foreign Affairs?) Some are reminiscent of the 19th century in the attitudes reflected by the police, the judges, the accused, their partners, families, supporters and employers. As oa-Afrika and Khumalo (interviews) correctly point out, they also reveal the troubling silences maintained by male gender activists and the "men's sector" generally. These dynamics are a stuck reminder of the time lapse since the draft Sexual Offences Bill and the struggles and resistance that can be anticipated in its implementation if/when it finally becomes law, and of Mtlaka's (interview) observation that in some cases (ignorant of the law or drunk with heteropatriarchal impunity, he does not say?) men may not be aware when they rape and women not aware they are being raped (even as we may suffer the effects of the violation) - phenomenon we know just too well from experiences of subtle and interpersonal racism.

Networks and coalitions

CMI organisations participate in various international, national and provincial, professional, gender and other networks illustrated in the foregoing pages and listed on websites and interviews. Among CMI-specific entities, Masimanyane's website states that the organisation intends to coordinate a network while MIPAA and a myriad of nascent and long existing men's forums are intended to function as networks. EngenderHealth is part of the 365 days of activism against GBV initiative (Gender links website). Besides naming itself as a network, the newly formed Sonke Gender Justice attaches importance to its staff members' background as active participants of the MAP network. Peacock and Botha (2006, and other various documents by the former on EngenderHealth website) describe the MAP network as having 'nearly 30 member organisations' in 'most of the nine provinces' with large and small affiliates. However, only the Western Cape MAP network that includes five academic institutions appears well functioning. Interviews (Tshabalala, Letswalo, Mabizela, Raletsemo, Mbonani) point to a once upon a time dynamic Gauteng MAP network that has ceased to function. Reasons for this vary according to informant. Some point at change of leadership while others believe that community based member organisations whose participation was initially sponsored by EngenderHealth, cannot afford resources for continued participation now that the sponsorship has come to an end. Whatever the reasons, EngenderHealth has to agree an official position and inform the members and, to fulfil the hopes of interviewed Gauteng MAP network members, as soon as possible revive the network and involve members in shaping its way forward. Including the Eastern Cape PPASA members who mentioned MAP as a methodology, none of the interviewees in other provinces counted MAP among the networks in which they participated.

There is general agreement that a national network or coalition is necessary for the success of CMI, over and above existing disparate efforts. Its modalities and relationship to Government remain a bone of contention. Khumalo (interview) suggests that the NGM CMI structure, when it does come to life, must function as *the* CMI network in order to avoid contests and disagreements among NGOs over coordination. I have discussed problems associated with government-reliant activism and initiatives earlier. Many believe more effort must go towards organising a civil society network/coalition. Those in other provinces and rural areas believe Gauteng initiatives already benefit from networking while

maintaining a healthy competition that should not hamper collaborations. They hope this would be extended into a civil society national CMI network.

Among the purposes envisaged, a national network/coalition would provide a platform to define a constructive masculine agenda, forge a common positive bond among men and work towards unity so that, for instance, men can break their muteness and speak out against women abuse and give constant coordinated reaction to emerging and publicised cases. It would assist in fundraising and sharing resources such as knowledge, training, methods, tools, problem solving and, above all, strategising for growing CMI into a movement that (properly linked with the women's and other movements) can work towards gender equality. It would contribute towards building a useful commonly available and continuously updated data base and provide NGOs the necessary space to negotiate and democratically appoint credible representatives to bodies such as SANAC, NGM and so on, while ensuring their accountability. Some caution that it would have to be well organised so as not to divert precious time, finance and other resources (from in particular the less endowed CBOs).

The lack of symbiosis

Commonly, the question of interconnections seems to evade most 'gender mainstreaming' attempts, CMI initiatives counted among the lot.¹¹ This shortcoming is quite acute within and between some government departments and their sub-divisions, at certain levels, notwithstanding the cluster approach. It is also evident in many NGOs. Research must uncover whether housing men's programs under one roof with women's and other programs has led to real interconnections to deal with the web of relations that define and are defined by gender while interlocking with other identity markers. Do they treat activities within one organisation holistically so that a critical gender consciousness is infused into programs throughout the institution? Hope Worldwide exemplifies the contrary with its six programs working as silos under one roof, long after it embraced a MAP program. It is only with their recent expansion in 2006 that their MAP and VCT programs planned to work together (and with DoH clinics) in their new Johannesburg sites, Diepsloot, Zandspruit, Alexandra (interview Letswalo). Yet, nonetheless, all its other programs - Prevention, Care and Support, and Orphaned and Vulnerable Children - need to benefit from the in-house MAP gender sensitivity.

Organisations often make the mistake of preaching what they do not practice in their structuring and culture, offering services to communities and other entities and spreading lessons they themselves would do well to learn. Women's organisations that introduced CMI/MAP may share useful insights into how they have handled consistent challenges trying to reign in men's initiatives to remain symbiotically linked. A staff member of one such organisation said he had been "roped in to refocus the men's program" for this purpose. Sinai claims on its web that its staff members practise what they preach in all aspects. It would be useful to find out what lessons the experience offers.

¹¹ Feminists have and continue to critique and expose the limits of 'mainstreaming' from various perspectives (f.i. Tsikata 2001, White 2003)

Consider the following report by Gobind (2005:144), 'MIPAA enjoys great support and commitment from all levels within the country's men's sector and has very good relationships with both national and provincial Aids Councils.' [Interviewed, the country's men's sector thinks differently of MIPAA.] *No mention of the country's women's sector!* The silence over and de-linking from women's organs appears a predominant feature. How problematic or simplistic is it to provide a male space and what are the costs if not carefully conceptualised and planned? The following exemplifies this rampant lack of symbiosis. Though it did not occur to Gobind and other men-focused MIPAA describers such as (the self-identified pro-feminist) Peacock and Botha (2006) not to eclipse this historical link, it is important to note that a similar but women-focused initiative under the auspices of the same Department of Health, WIPAA (Women in Partnership Against AIDS), existed since 1997/8, years before MIPAA. Both enjoy representation at SANAC (South African National Aids Council) when it is functional. The successes and failures of WIPAA may lend valuable lessons to MIPAA. In North West DoH, for instance, 1997/8, WIPAA was made the responsibility of an official purely because she was/is woman, by luck she became very committed the more she received training and developed relevant and fulfilling activities with home based carers and others doing HIV related work in communities (interview Motlhaping). In the same DoH in the 21st century MIPAA was allocated to a man - the same (il)logic but with not much luck this time. An official remembers being invited once to a gathering in Durban which would have worked towards creating links between WIPAA and MIPAA but 'nothing happened thereafter, WIPAA work Continues, we don't see MIPAA'. Separatism can be costly.

Poverty, economic empowerment and finance

While poverty is acknowledged as one of the factors that define gender relations in some communities and households, it is important not to imply that it is the only factor, therefore, further stigmatising the poor. In South Africa, as elsewhere in the world, gender based violence and HIV happen across racial, class, age, sexuality and other boundaries, yet, like a chameleon, the vulnerability, incidence, manifestations, effects and affects differ according context. Example, says Siya Mtlaka (interview) pressure on poor men to be providers of income often leads to them dropping out of CMI programs.

Health-e News Service (Bodibe 1.2.2007 and 30.1.2007 respectively) featured news of two pieces of research. The first states the claim that access to money has reduced rural women's vulnerability to HIV infection in rural Limpopo. Heeding such messages, a number of men's projects include economic empowerment aspects.¹² Perhaps the "men's sector" can take or has taken lessons from decades of Income Generation Projects by women's organisations and evaluations thereof.

As if in refutation, or sending a warning not to imagine money as panacea, the second announces research findings by Unisa and Makinor that HIV infection is escalating most rapidly among the wealthier and educated. In South Africa and in the global economy, wealth remains firmly in white men's hands (Khumalo 2005). Decisions by the white male

¹² F.i. Amandla Madoda views income generation for men as an equally important element of their comprehensive male-focused project, based on the view that economic empowerment for men will enable men to 'fulfil themselves', to look after and protect their families (interviews Friedman, Mthethwa).

establishment in Washington, for instance, to bomb countries, not to fund reproductive health/HIV entities that include termination of pregnancy in their work, or for NGOs to follow only strategies dictated by them, are felt (albeit differently) by the poorest women and men in Iraq and South Africa. Washington's warmongering emphasises the Machiavellian notion that violence is the last arbiter. Conditions dictated by the World Bank and International Monetary Fund, shifted the burden of care, among other things, from state (sponsored) institutions to women generally, with the poorest feeling the pinch the worst, and with poverty increased by cuts on governments spending on e.g. education dictated by the same powers, the Brettonwood institutions, and by effects of war.

There is hardly any CMI work focused on the wealthier and or white men. This has the effect not only of tainting violence and AIDS as exclusive to poor and black communities, in as much as it essentialises whiteness, ignoring differences in the white (male) populations. Even with apartheid opening the world out for them, it thrived on deep divisions and differences among whites and on entrenching the ethos of violence. Jabu oa-Afrika (interview) observes that there is a white men's movement, middle and upper class dominated, which uses publications to communicate - academic and others like *Men's Health*, *New Afrikaner*. [*Blink* tried a focus on black men but it soon died while *Leadership* aims at the corporate.] Reminiscent of omnipresent feminist concern, many bemoan the 'white gaze' on black experience while little is said about violence in white communities (e.g. interviews oa-Afrika, Khumalo, Motsei). It is up to only a decade ago that the mainstay of whiteness, colonial-apartheid male socialisation hinged on white supremacy, militarism, racism, and misogyny. Many forms of gender based violence and femicides plague/d the harsh Afrikaner patriarchy, the so-called English speaking communities being no exception as, among other things, control of white women's bodies and sexuality and their 'protection' from imagined 'zwart gevaar' and the racialisation cum sexualisation of the Black Other, took/take on violent forms. Not much has changed. To date, the racial undertone with crime reports continues to paint the perception that criminals are black men, of course, conveniently excluding 'white collar crime' where white men's dominance amounts to billions of Rand.

The need to build bridges, feminists and pro-feminists

Pro-feminists, feminists, groups working with men, and women's advocacy groups have to establish closer working relations to sort out issues of disagreements and common interest that thwart or enhance progress. Only through dialoguing across race, class, gender, sexuality, etcetera, can common learning and negotiations take place. But that raises questions of modus operandi as issues I raise in this and other segments demonstrate.

What does inter-linking succinctly with women's struggles and structures mean in practice for men? As they tout men's participation in the struggle for gender equality, Joyce Piliso-Seroke (in Potgieter 2005) and Bafana Khumalo (2005) are among the many who insist that the role of leadership 'should continue to be played by women', a fundamental premise that must not be compromised. In the last local elections, the ANC instructed its branches to up the proportion of women candidates in relation to men from 30/70 to 50/50. To be sure, ANC quotas are the result of women's advocacy and tireless lobbying aiming to increase the

participation of women in social institutions from which we were historically excluded as a gender.¹³ There was a lot of grumbling, open and hidden resistance by men within and outside the movement to both ratios at the time of their introduction. Men's violence against women has been analysed as backlash directly related to the ratio question (Peacock et al 2006). However, gender-mainstreaming-ratios chickens have come home to roost for feminists as male gender activists claim technicist statistical mainstreaming gender equality for men to participate in institutions. Of interest is the raging debate about the women/men ratio in the composition of CGE commissioners. Some men (e.g. Khumalo interview) advocate a 50/50 ratio (instead of the 12/2 in women's favour). There is a strong feminist and other women's voice opposing the proposal and hoping the CGE and President Mbeki, the final arbiter, will stick to the undertaking that while it includes issues of men and masculinity in it's work, the CGE recognises women as it's primary beneficiaries, a positions that, according to Piliso-Seroke its chairperson, was arrived at after extensive research at its inception and from experience since (Potgieter 2005:154).

Many pro-feminist male gender activists lament the lack of trust by women activists. This, they suggest, is also manifested in donors' reluctance to fund CMI. I asked some of the women's organisations to give a progress report since 1997/8 regarding their CMI initiatives. The need to continue involving men was endorsed as well as pointing out the hardness of that sojourn. Many recalled the example of a man who set up his own men's organisation in the same clinic where a women's organisation that had trained and employed him operated; thus competing for resources and appropriating much else. This long response from Vanessa Ludwig sums up commonly expressed sentiment and concerns in feminist circles. Yes, GEU, the Gender Equity Unit continues to include men and to ensure feminist leadership. However,

The focus on men and masculinities has affected many projects and programmes at UWC, as well as our community-partnership ones. This has definitely *taken the focus away from women and women-centred programmes*. The HIV/AIDS projects, the GBV projects, and even the academic programmes have shifted their focus, mainly as the result of *more and more funding being made available for programmes with men* - the idea being that we need to change men to end GBV. *Women's empowerment projects have become secondary*, and where women are engaged, the emphasis tends to be that women must 'stop playing the victim' and 'own their agency'. *Maintaining a feminist agenda has become increasingly difficult*, particularly with all the gender-divas constantly telling us that 'gender is about women AND MEN'. The result has been that *patriarchs have managed to gain significant footholds within the 'gender arena'*, many becoming project leaders/researchers (my italics).

Yet another issue reverberates that can be summed up in the feminist-popularised slogan, 'the personal is political' in its multiple manifestations and nuances, far from implying a simplistic inclusion of apartheid in CMI/Map training modules.¹⁴ Men gender activists are challenged to make personal the gender progressive politics they preach and to place the personal central to theorising. Besides being risky in the era of HIV, continued behaviour of

¹³ This needs to be emphasised to dispel the myth that the President wakes up one morning and decides what 'manna' to throw at women. True a different President might remain less receptive or even resistant to the advocacy, lobbying, policies and internal debate in the different structures.

¹⁴ I elaborate elsewhere (1996) on its expressions in gender training, which issues apply here as well.

some male gender activists negatively taints the CMI project and relations with women's advocacy groups and individuals. For instance, women complain of experiencing or witnessing first hand sexual harassment by their male gender activist colleagues. An example is repeated of a man who often hops from one woman GFP to another, attempting to initiate sexual relations as soon as workshops end (interviews Motsei, Matooane), as if to prove the saying, 'ntate ke mokopu oa naba', so often confronted and ably disputed by Komako (interview) as he trains traditional leaders. In the process, such sexual harassment makes a mockery of and erases in one swoop the messages contained in the CMI talk preached by the said gender activist to these GFPs and those around them. Such a man is a far cry from the beginnings of being a 'work in progress', an expression Tshabalala (interview) invokes when he reflects on the positive change he has undergone, theoretically, professionally and in *doing* gender, and the subtle habits of socialisation that sometimes resurface unexpectedly requiring continued vigilance, dialogue and commitment to change. Reflexive endeavours, acts of positioning the self, insisted upon mainly by black feminist thought, scholarship and activism, demand more than mere declarations of being gender activists.

At another level, the feminist ethos, the personal is political, has been beautifully captured in most of the CMI methodologies that position the individual man as part of the problem and hence constructively engage experience-based participatory methods that end by emphasising the agency of the individual without discounting the context. Mtlaka and Letswalo, among other interviews, describe the empowering potential of this method.

The above are genuine debates that have raged on since the development industry 'discovered' the concept of 'gender' and simplified it into a statistical equation and technical tool that donors use to flex their economic muscle, to dictate the terms. The insistence to include men at all costs, whatever the power relations, misses the power dynamics, politics, the nuances, and the circumstances that propelled women to organise and resist patriarchy in the first place, circumstances that have not changed significantly. The lack of rapport indicates the need to revisit conceptualisation of oppression and resistance, solidarity and leadership of struggles between oppressor groups and the oppressed, power relations dynamically defined by gender and other processes.

Do origins matter? Though attempting to answer the same social problems accruing hegemonic, combative, violent masculinities, it is clear that constructive male involvement was inspired by different sources, whatever the commonalities and co-operations today. It is always difficult to avoid an element of generalisation, nonetheless, below are more of the emerging trends waiting to be confirmed or disputed by further research. [Initiatives by different government departments respond to policy and other directives from above and have already received much comment in the preceding pages.]

As we have seen, civil society CMI is in large part the result of introspection by feminists and women's organisations (as is the case elsewhere) and in part initiatives by men for men. Looking at the 1990s there are clearly home grown initiatives while others were born out of Euro-American entities' wish to expand within and into South Africa. Though aimed at men, the defining feature of the home-grown CMI at their inception was their strong link with and leadership by women, feminists and women's organised formations in conceptualising and

crafting their modus operandi. Bongani Khumalo (1998) describes consultations and attempts made towards the establishment of the male-led SAMF and its predecessor to avoid falling into the trap of colluding with agendas that perpetuate hegemonic masculinities, in practice.

On the other hand, I could find no evidence of the captains of Euro-American initiatives taking the trouble to make such links, this in spite of their professing pro-feminism (which raises the question whether they ever imagined the existence of feminists/ims in these parts of the world). Wielding much more resources than the medium and much smaller home-grown NGOs/CBOs, they seem to have simply gone about recruiting native men and getting them to participate in workshops aiming initially at convincing them to change their risky and violent behaviour and attitudes, and getting them to perform household chores.¹⁵ In addition to this, while they made enthusiastic efforts to collaborate with other institutions and groupings as they began their work, none of the now established CMI groups from outside the women's movement describe ever attempting at the time to link with their similarly intentioned CMI 'brother organisations'. Each seeks to create their own turf.

Arguably and without discounting the benefits they have accrued and the developments they have undergone, methods and processes such as MAP have spread and come to dominate the CMI space, a contested space. As some inspired graduates continue to apply them, questions keep arising: Are they easily applicable to rural, little or not formally educated communities? Do they embed social transformative 'tools'? Did they re-inventing the wheel and leave out solutions that lie closer to home, in the African experience?

Do origins matter? Hope Chikudu (2005:26) reminds us that 'History is pretty useless if it does not give us a basis to explain the present in which we find ourselves'. Apart from documenting history, origins matter in ways that have become sensitive in this 'present in which we find ourselves' rightly described by Motsei (interview) as having glossed over the wounds of apartheid and now threatening to gloss over the wounds of patriarchy (see also Mcfadden 2006). As CMI activists agree, race, class, nationality, ethnicity, gender etcetera collude in defining masculinities; so do economic North/South divisions come into play, as Khumalo elaborates (2005). Coming out of a history of colonial-capitalist apartheid, infested with heteropatriarchy, into a neo-colonial flux dominated by similarly gendered and hierarchised globalisation, yesteryear's questions about these relations may be hibernating but they have not died - ways of being and ways of doing cannot be expected to have changed overnight. They need openly airing and working out.

There is a generally expressed perception (interviews) that white men dominate CMI and masculinities scholarship and that some take their cure from EuroAmerican scholarship unproblematised (Black Feminists can share experiences of that political quagmire). Black feminists regard CMI with a mixture of understandable caution and scepticism as discussed above. Black male gender activists describe with passion how CMI work (that began at different times for each individual, with some dating their cathartic processes back to the days of the freedom struggle) has made/is making them into more fulfilled and caring men, partners, colleagues, community members, leaders and activists. Yet black male gender

¹⁵ This missionary approach is reminiscent of broader development, feminist and other anti-imperialist discourses.

activists (and black feminists) talk with equal passion about how further success of CMI is threatened by the lack of adequate indigenous sensitivities.

The preoccupation of the African men and women, therefore, is with finding ways of drawing constructively on African ways of being and of doing, heterogeneous as they are. Many sum it up in the philosophy of Ubuntu/Botho; among others, Tshabalala (interviewed) emphasises the need for the excavation of indigenous knowledge systems, mindful of their orality. Many have begun doing this, some unconsciously, others consciously.

6 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Asked to reflect on government departments' CMI performance so far, Mokgethi Tshabalala exclaimed 'I have seen sparks of brilliance' (interview). Perhaps this sums up the field of constructive men's involvement in gender based violence and HIV&AIDS in South Africa, if not globally. There are sparks of brilliance across the spectrum. This research indicates a diverse and growing number. While a handful seems to vanish without a trace and another shrinks, expands and shrinks again like the accordion, some survive and stabilise for varying periods, new initiatives continue to appear on the scene to take their place in this seemingly tumultuous space. Sparks there may be, the CMI movement has travelled kilometres, considering that concerted efforts seem to have taken off a mere decade ago, accompanying the post-1994 promise of freedom. The volume in section 7 is impressive.

I have pointed out debates evoked by the CMI work, and used that as a way of naming some of the perceptions, strengths, contradictions, politics and challenges that are known, silenced and or invisibilised, and symptoms of ruptures that need mending. These are not only theoretical debates. They are also concerns with finding ways of turning the 'sparks of CMI brilliance into a movement that, *acting together with other movements*, can relate to all the oppressed, discriminated and exploited, the rural and urban African, alike; and, most importantly take us closer to achieving transformations that lead to social justice because, as Castels (1997) writes, transformations can easily lead to nightmares. Answers to these lie in further research, internal and external oriented dialogues, building bridges, networking.

The challenges for CMI and the gender equity project as a whole are multi-fold with the most defining feature being the imperative to forge interconnections, to constantly inter-link. If CMI initiatives are to make a dent on hegemonic masculinities and heteropatriarchy, and on the symbiotic epidemics, gender based violence and HIV&AIDS, they have to be inter-linked at various levels: with feminisms and the women's movements (heterogeneous and weak as they appear); with other entities focusing on the different aspects related to the epidemics specifically and generally; and with struggles and initiatives aimed at structural transformation. As they say, charity begins at home. Equally urgent are the inter-linkages internal to the men's movements (if one can use that to refer to the different CMI fragments) forging spaces for collaborations and coordination; initiating and sustaining networks and coalitions using different permutations, sometimes the lowest denominators and other times the highest.

The recommendations that follow are based on the foregoing explorations. It is my considered opinion that,

- Deeper and broader quantitative survey and qualitative research into CMI are urgently needed, the foregoing has raised several relative areas of concern;
- Research must encompass African Indigenous Knowledge Systems, herstories and histories, as part of further strategising and crafting of methodologies;
- Deeper gender analysis of colonial-apartheid and globalisation needs incorporation into CMI understanding and praxis at personal, institutional and methodological levels;
- Means to re-focus CMI are to be devised to ensure that it is dominated and peopled by activists who fully comprehend gender power politics of heteropatriarchy, the need to work together across several divide, and the need to work on the self;
- Male gender activists and professionals need to work out modalities for closer collaboration with feminists, female gender activists and women's groups and organisations;
- Ways are to be found of identifying, talking openly about, and negotiating difference in the work towards gender and social justice;
- Feminist leadership of the movement is to be persistently sought and strengthened;
- A CMI data base needs to be developed, constantly upgraded, well kept and made accessible;
- Revival of the MAP network and meetings in Gauteng needs to be prioritised;
- EngenderHealth needs to engage other NGOs, CBOs etc to explore the need and modalities of a civil society network or coalition that will be closer to representing male voices emanating from outside state power and direct influence;
- EngenderHealth has to deepen the level of training among the MAP network partners/trainees to include better and more sophisticated knowledge of the gender concept so it is not diluted and depoliticised;
- Facilitation skills are to be improved around handling sensitive and painful issues in workshops so that methods, facilitation and facilitators' (in)actions do not lead to vicarious trauma and re-traumatisation of participants, e.g. rape survivors;
- Contact with entities like ETU is to be pursued in an effort to form partnerships for training and support on the ground; This would strengthen the capacity of the Provincial and municipal Aids Councils, MIPAA, WIPAA, thus assisting the Department of Health to carry out its mandate and the interlinkages with SANAC;
- Ties with departments of Social Development, Health, police, justice etc to be strengthened;
- EngenderHealth and other CMI services should be made more known to provincial CGEs and CBOs outside Gauteng as they appear hungry for capacity building and networking.

All said and done, it is important to note that many of the challenges and recommendations discussed in these pages are not unique to CMI, the women's movements may do well to heed them.

REFERENCES

- Castels, M, 1997, *The Power of Identity*, Blackwell, Oxford
- Chikudu, H, 2006, 'Reflections on the strategies used by women's organisations since 1985,' in *Agenda* No 69 pp26-34
- Commission on Gender Equality, CGE, 2002, Provincial Gender Indaba report, 25-27 November, Bloemfontein
- 2003, National Conference on Gender Based Violence, 26-28 November, Kimberly
 - 2005, National Men's Summit Report, 15-17 March, 2005, Durban
- Gobind, R 2005, South African men care enough to act against HIV/AIDS, *Agenda*, special focus, 144-145
- Gqola, Pumla Dineo, 2006, 'After Zuma: Gender Violence and our constitution', Ruth First Lecture, 15 November, Constitution Hill, Johannesburg <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/2.5/za/>
- Hayward, 2005, "Some Organisations Working with Men and Boys to End Violence Against Women and Girls" by Ruth Finney Hayward rhayward@unicef.org; [Prevent Gender Based Violence Africa](http://www.preventgenderbasedviolence.org) website on February 22 2005; and email from Mmatshilo Motsei to The Communication Initiative, September 29 2006.
- Health-e News service 30.1.2007, 6.2.2007
- Health Systems Trust, HST, 2006, *South African Health Review*, Health systems Trust, Durban
- Khumalo, Bafana, 2005, 'The role of men in the struggle for gender equality: possibilities for positive engagement, in *Agenda*, special focus pp 88-95
- Khumalo, Bongani, 1998, 'Restoring the soul of the nation', *Agenda* No 37 pp 46-48
- Kumalo, P, 1997, 'Sexual harassment? It's a no-go area, in *Agenda* No 36
- Lewis, Desiree, 2004, *Gender-based violence*, Womensnet Gender Stats [www.womensnet.org.za]
- Lorber, J, 1994, *Paradoxes of Gender*, Yale University Press, New Haven & London
- Makhaye, G, 1998, 'Shosholozza's goal: educate men in soccer', *Agenda* No 39, 93-96
- Masimanyane Women's Support Centre, 2003, "Including Men in the Struggle to end Violence against Women", Conference report, East London, South Africa
http://www.masimanyane.org.za/Men_s_Conference_2003.doc
- Matlanyane Sexwale, BM, 1994, 'Violence Against Women: Experiences of South African Domestic Workers' in Afshar, Haleh and Maynard, Mary, *The Dynamics of 'Race' and Gender*, Taylor and Francis, London
- 1996, What happened to feminist politics in 'Gender Training'? in M Maynard and J Purvis, *New Frontiers in Women's Studies: Knowledge, Identity and Nationalism*, Taylor and Francis, earlier published as 'The politics of Gender training', *Agenda* No23 pp57-63, 1994
- McFadden, Patricia, 2006, 'Becoming Post Colonial in Southern Africa: imagining an alternative future, unpublished paper presented at Spelman College, March
- Monakali, Mandisa, 1997, 'Challenging the church', *Agenda* No 36 pp98-99
- Motsei, Mmatshilo, 2004 reprinted 2005, *Hearing Visions, Seeing Voices*, Jacana, Johannesburg
- Msimang, Sonke, 2006, 'Who will touch the 'dangerous women'? Sinners and suicide bombers as a challenge to the women's movement' in *Agenda* No 69, Durban, pp36-47
- Naidoo, Kumi, 1997, 'The men march' in *Agenda* No 36 pp 94-96
- Oyegun, J, 1998, 'Working masculinities into gender' in *Agenda* No 37 pp 13-23
- Parentzee, P, 1998, 'A men and women project confronts abuse, *Agenda* No 37 pp32-36
- Peacock, Dean and Botha, Mbuyiselo, *The New Gender Platforms and Fatherhood in Richter and Morrell R eds. Baba, Men and Fatherhood in South Africa*, HSRC Press, Cape Town, www.hsrcpress.ac.za
- Potgieter, Cheryl, 2005, 'Gender, Culture and Rights: challenges and approaches of the three Chapter 9 institutions' in *Agenda*, Special issue

- Smythe, D and Parenzee, P, 2003, *Domestic Violence and Development: Looking at the Family Context*, Institute of Criminology, Cape Town
- Richter, L and Morrell, R, eds. 2006, *Baba Men and Fatherhood in South Africa*, HSRC Press, Cape Town
- Swart, SS, 1998, letter, *Agenda* No 37, Durban pp4-6
- Tshabalala, Mokgethi, 2005, 'creating spaces for men's involvement in sexual and reproductive health' in *Agenda* Special focus
- Tsikata Dzodzi, 1997, 'Gender Equality and the State in Ghana', in A. Imam et al. *Engendering African Social Sciences*, CODESREA, Dakar
- 2001, *Gender Training in Ghana: Politics, Issues and Tools*, Woeli, Accra 2001
- White, Sarah, 2003, 'The 'Gender Lens': A Racial Blinder', paper presented for the International Workshop Feminist Fables and Gender Myths: Repositioning Gender in Development Policy and Practice, Institute of Development Studies (IDS) University of Sussex, 2-4 July
- Xaba, 2001, 'Masculinity and Malcontents' in Morrell, R. ed. *Changing Men in Southern Africa*, University of Natal Press, Pietermaritzburg

INTERVIEWED

Alfred Mikosi, SANAC, representative Men's sector	Liz Thebe, South African Post Office, (formerly Eskom)
Absalom Prof Moloi, ETU	Mafadza Edward, CGE Limpopo
Anthony Dywili, NC Ministers Fraternity, N Cape	Mahlomola Tau, Free State Men's Forum
Anu Pillay, CSV, Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation	Mantshali Moralo, S African Red Cross, Soweto
Bafana Khumalo, Sonke Gender Justice Network, former CGE, Commissioner	Mercia Appels, CGE, N Cape
Bandile Sizani, ETU	Mokgethi Tshabalala, EngenderHealth SA
Desiree Lewis, UWC	Mmatshilo Motsei, Founder/former Director ADAPT
Dumisani Rebombo, EngenderHealth briefing	Mthethwa, Amandla Madoda, MKhanyakude, KZN
Hardwick Thema, Fathers Speak Out, Soweto, Johannesburg	Muzi Mbonani, Itereleng Institute of Cultural Affairs SA
Irene Mngadi, Department of Social Development	Nceba Mrwebo, CGE E Cape
Irwin Friedman, Amandla Madoda and staff Health Systems Trust, Durban, KZN	Nhlanhla Dlamini, Department of Correctional Services, National
Jabu oa-Afrika, SAMAG, South African Men's Action Group, North West	Nhlanhla Mabizela, EngenderHealth SA, Johannesburg
Jessie Nhlapo, Thusanang Advocacy Centre, Qwaqwa, Free State	Nthekei Mkosana, formerly Department of Transport, National
Keletso Mamoledi, Care Givers, Baragwanath	Ntsoaki Motlhaping, Department of Health, NW
Kgomotso Mahapa, Department of Arts and Culture, National	Rabbuh Raletsemo, EngenderHealth SA
Khosi Nxumalo, CGE KZN	Siya Mtlaka, PPASA, W Cape
Komako Botha Samuel, Thusanang Advocacy, FS	Sonwabo Ngonini, ETU
Letswalo William, MAP, Hope World Wide	Teboho Matooane, Gender Consultant
	Themmani Chamane, CGE, KZN
	Vanessa Ludwig, Gender Equity Unit, UWC, W Cape
	Xolani Tshandu, PPASA, W Cape

Bunie M. Matlanyane Sexwale is a consultant - research, training, support, evaluations etc. Focus: Development generally; women and gender. Tel 0842076864, buniems@gmail.com